

CITY OF SUMMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

MEETING DATE: JULY 16, 2025 TIME: 7:00 PM

LOCATION: CITY HALL, LARGE CONFERENCE ROOM (SECOND FLOOR)

CALL TO ORDER: 7:00 PM

ADEQUATE NOTICE STATEMENT

PRESENT: CAROLINE KING, JAMES BURGMAYER, MIKE DIGERONIMO, MARY MALLOY, SUSAN BRADY, JENNIFER ALVAREZ

ABSENT: MEREDITH GAYLORD, JESSICA ROY, BONNIE MORRISON, NICK CURIALE, BOB PAWLOWSKI

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: MEETING OF JUNE 18, 2025

S Brady moved to ratify submission; J Burgmeyer seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

ADVISORY REVIEWS: Items for Discussion

1. 23 Baltusrol Place: (c) variance for building coverage and lot coverage. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Ashland-Road-to-Beekman-Road-Vol-2.pdf> p307-308 c1925 Colonial Revival non-contributing **Deantown**; aluminum siding over original. 23 Baltusrol Place a c1925 Colonial Revival is located in the Deantown Historic District. The proposed addition is in the rear of the house and not visible from the public right of way. The massing of the addition is consistent with the home. S Brady moved to ratify submission; M DiGeronimo seconded. The motion carried unanimously.
2. 80 Elm Street: (c) variance to demolish and rebuild existing detached garage at rear of property. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Doremus-Street-to-Gloucester-Road-Vol-4.pdf> p163-164 **c1895 Contributes to streetscape**. 80 Elm Street c1895 is listed in the Summit Survey of Historic Resources as contributing to the streetscape. The proposed garage is located in the rear of the property. Materials are not noted in the proposal. The HPC recommends wood siding to match the original exterior, or Hardi board as an alternative. The HPC recommends the applicant echo the style and windows of the existing historic home and follow the Development Regulation Ordinance (DRO) design guidelines. S Brady moved to ratify submission; M DiGeronimo seconded. The motion carried unanimously.
3. 695 Springfield Avenue: Beacon Unitarian Universalist Congregation in Summit. Revised plans July 8, 2025. Tandem parking stalls increased parking on-site to 46 spaces. Increasing building coverage of 8,811 square feet from 3,083 sq ft. to 11,795 sq ft. reduced to 11,430 sq ft. Sewer demand summary. Stormwater management report. View from adjacent properties. Glare/lighting studies. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf> p65-66 **1901 Historical Significance**.
 - The revised plans do not address any issues raised by the HPC. The HPC has no comment wrt to the revisions that refer to parking, building coverage, sewer demand, and stormwater management.
 - The view from adjacent properties and glare/lighting studies do not address the HPC comments dated: 11/18/24 and 5/30/25.
 - The scale and massing of the proposed sanctuary structure and the **significant loss of tree cover** across the whole property will create a stark change along Springfield Avenue and the surrounding properties.
 - The front-facing façade consists of two sections of large blank walls (approximately 40' long x 30' tall and 60'x30' tall) of EIFS stucco and wood planking, a portion of which

projects in the required front yard setback as close as 42.7' to the Springfield Avenue right-of-way. The proposed streetscape is inconsistent with the Development Design Guidelines (DDG) in the City's Developments Regulations Ordinance (DRO).

- The proposed design does not follow the Development Regulations Ordinance (DRO), Development Design Guidelines, refer to 35 Attachment 1, Appendix A. 35-19.1 <https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/3616/Development-Regulations-Ordinance-DRO-FINAL?bId=p320> (PDF p328) including scale, massing, height, materials, roof, and siting.
- The proposed design is inconsistent with the 2000 Master Plan Historic Plan Element, the Master Plan Reexamination Report November 2006, and Master Plan Re-examination 2016 as The Red Cross was defined as historic.
- 2000 Master Plan: <https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/1396/2000-City-of-Summit-Master-Plan?bId=PDF p72, p76>
 - 1. That it is in the public interest to identify and conserve sites and districts of historic interest.
 - 2. That the designation of historic sites and districts take into consideration not only the age of a structure, but its historic, cultural, sociological, archeological or architectural significance from a local, regional, statewide or national perspective.
 - Criteria 1. Important to the general development of the area and the unique cultural heritage of their communities.
 - Criteria 2. Significant examples of an architectural style or period.
 - Criteria 4. Associated with important persons or groups, with a social or political movement, or with a historical event.
- 11/18/24 [D3 variances for deviations from standards of conditional use: lot size less than 2 acres, front yard less than 50 feet, side yard setback/ buffer less than 50 feet, lot coverage exceeding 40 percent, bldg. covg exceeding 15 percent, parking setback less than 20 ft, rear yard buffer less than twenty percent of lot depth. C variances for number of onsite parking spaces, front and side yard setbacks and buffers, rear yard buffers and size of a monument sign identifying the church], 2/21/25 and
- 5/30/25 [Revised plans for: Major Site plan approval, preliminary and final. Propose to **demolish existing structures** and replace with new.]
- The HPC objects to the application in its revised form. The HPC emphasizes that **Adaptive Reuse** is one of the greenest techniques that can be employed. Reuse is a great way to be sustainable while respecting the history of the community. We would suggest the applicant consider incorporating the existing principal structure into the design of the complex and could be a location for the meeting rooms, offices and other secondary functions that occupy the proposed sprawling footprint.
- HPC restates the recommendation that the applicant seek a design solution that is more contextual; sensitive to the neighborhood and surroundings; and more consistent with the Development Design Guidelines in the DRO and the City's Master Plan.
- J Burgmeyer moved to ratify submission; M DiGeronimo seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

1. Summit NJ honored racing legend Mark Donohue Jr. as Chelsea Asitimbay advocated for preserving his childhood home [68 Valley View Avenue] <https://www.tapinto.net/towns/summit/sections/arts-and-entertainment/articles/intern-highlights-race-car-legend-s-roots-amid-brad-pitt-f1-buzz>
2. Demolition applications/permits
 - 573 Springfield Avenue: Demolition application submitted. An 1880 altered Queen Anne home with a historic name, Porter House. The exterior wall fabric is aluminum siding over original. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf> p3. The City of Summit Historic Preservation Plan Element (VII. Master Plan) goals states “that it is in the public interest to identify and conserve sites and districts of historic interest.” While the proposed design meets the design guidelines and utilizes quality material, the HPC recommends restoration and adaptive reuse as a first consideration.
 - 42 Norwood Avenue: Notification from DCS re: Demo Permit for one of the buildings at Kent Place School at 42 Norwood Ave.
3. August reviews
4. Historic Sites Inventory

OLD BUSINESS

1. Ordinance
2. 68 Valley View Avenue: Planning Board Agenda Hearing Monday July 28, 2025 https://www.cityofsummit.org/AgendaCenter/ViewFile/Agenda_07282025-1251
3. 695 Springfield Avenue: Red Cross/Beacon Unitarian Universalist Congregation in Summit. Council Meeting Agenda <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf> p65-66 **1901**. The house was built as the home of David Leslie Young, who moved to Summit from Brooklyn in 1900. The Young family had a lumber and millwork business in New York City, and artisans from the shop are said to have supervised construction of the house's interior. The Young family occupied the house until 1945. In 1959, it was purchased by the **Red Cross**, and has been used as their offices since that time. The house was a notable architectural achievement, harmoniously combining elements of Tudor half timbering, Mediterranean stucco and arcades, and prairie style emphasis of roof and chimney.

LIASON UPDATES:

1. Planning Board

MEETING ADJOURNED: 8:30 PM

NEXT MEETING DATE: September 17, 2025