

CITY OF SUMMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA
MEETING DATE: JUNE 18, 2025 TIME: 7:00 PM
LOCATION: CITY HALL, LARGE CONFERENCE ROOM (SECOND FLOOR)

CALL TO ORDER
ADEQUATE NOTICE STATEMENT

ROLL CALL: CAROLINE KING, JAMES BURGMAYER, MIKE DIGERONIMO, MEREDITH GAYLORD, MARY MALLOY, JESSICA ROY, SUSAN BRADY, BONNIE MORRISON, NICK CURIALE, JENNIFER ALVAREZ (PLANNING BOARD LIASON), BOB PAWLOWSKI (COUNCIL LIAISON)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: MEETING OF MAY 21, 2025

ADVISORY REVIEWS: Items for Discussion

1. 695 Springfield Avenue: Red Cross/Beacon Unitarian Universalist Congregation in Summit. Revised plans for: Major Site plan approval, preliminary and final. Propose to demolish existing structures and replace with new. New structures will be used as classrooms, offices and church space. Propose 42 space parking area, solar panels in parking area, and landscaping improvements.

As reviewed in November 2024:

- The scale and massing of the proposed sanctuary structure and the significant loss of tree cover across the whole property will create a stark change along Springfield Avenue and the surrounding properties.
- The front-facing façade consists of two sections of large blank walls (approximately 40' long x 30' tall and 60' x 30' tall) of EIFS stucco and wood planking, a portion of which projects in the required front yard setback as close as 42.7' to the Springfield Avenue right-of-way. The proposed streetscape is inconsistent with the Development Design Guidelines (DDG) in the City's Developments Regulations Ordinance (DRO).
- The applicant's efforts to include green and sustainable elements in this application are commendable and the HPC would like to point out that Adaptive Reuse is one of the greenest techniques that can be employed. Reuse is a great way to be sustainable while respecting the history of the community. We would suggest the applicant consider incorporating the existing principal structure into the design of the complex and could be a location for the meeting rooms, offices and other secondary functions that occupy the proposed sprawling footprint.
- The original house was built in 1901 as private residence and was later adaptively reused as American Red Cross offices for many decades. As noted in the Historic Sites Survey (<https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf> p65-66) "The house was built as the home of David Leslie Young, who moved to Summit from Brooklyn in 1900. The Young family had a lumber and millwork business in New York City, and artisans from the shop are said to have supervised construction of the house's interior. The Young family occupied the house until 1945. In 1959, it was purchased by the Red Cross, and has been used as their offices since that time. The house was a notable architectural achievement, harmoniously combining elements of Tudor half timbering, Mediterranean stucco and arcades, and prairie style emphasis of roof and chimney."
- Of particular note are the deep porches and terraces on the exterior and the unique entry rotunda and elaborate millwork inside portions of the home.
- The HPC objects to the application in its current form and would recommend that the applicant seek a design solution that is more contextual; sensitive to the neighborhood

and surroundings; and more consistent with the Development Design Guidelines in the DRO and the City's Master Plan.

With respect to the February 2025 review: additional documents - traffic study.

- The HPC has no comment

Regarding the proposal to demolish existing structures and replace with new:

- None of the comments from the HPC review from November 2024 have been addressed.
- There has not been any substantive change in the proposed design of the structure.
- The revisions in the current proposal still require twelve (12) variances.
 1. Land Use
 2. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Min. Lot Area (AC)
 3. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Min. Side Yard Building Setback (FT) each side
 4. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Max. Building Height (Stories/FT)
 5. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Max. Lot Coverage (%)
 6. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Max. Building Coverage (%)
 7. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Side Yard Buffer (%)
 8. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Rear Yard Buffer (FT)
 9. Area, Bulk & Yard Requirements: Min. Parking Setback (FT)
 10. Accessory Structure: Accessory Use (Solar Canopy)
 11. Driveway, Parking & Loading Regulations: Min. Number of Parking Spaces
 12. Driveway, Parking & Loading Regulations: Min. Parking Lot Landscaping
- The proposed design does not follow the Development Regulations Ordinance (DRO), Development Design Guidelines, refer to 35 Attachment 1, Appendix A. 35-19.1 <https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/3616/Development-Regulations-Ordinance-DRO-FINAL?bidId=p320> (PDF p328)
 - Scale: "Scale refers to the relative size of a building in terms of height, footprint, and volume. New buildings shall be of the same general scale or size as adjacent buildings." The proposed structure requires twelve variances.
 - Massing: "Massing refers to the volumetric relationship between various parts of the building. The new construction shall be of the same general massing as adjacent buildings." The proposed front-facing façade consists of two sections of large blank walls that total approximately 100' long x 30' tall.
 - Height: "The height of proposed buildings or additions shall be visually compatible with adjacent buildings... Considerations include maintaining overall proportions and the compatibility of the visual lines that give a sense of height of the building. These include rooflines, eave lines, and cornice lines." The proposed 30' height is continuous through much of the structure.
 - Materials: "To create a harmonious streetscape, new buildings shall be constructed of the same or compatible materials as that of its neighbors." Exterior Insulation Finishing Systems (EIFS), sometimes referred to as synthetic stucco, is a type of cladding that provides wall exteriors with an insulated finished surface. The proposed EIFS stucco and wood planking is inconsistent with the materials of the neighboring structures.
 - Roof: "New buildings and additions shall have roof lines that are in harmony with neighboring buildings of similar style..." The 30' proposed roof proximate a straight vertical wall in contrast the the Red Cross building's pitched roof with ridge and eave lines, and is not in harmony with neighboring buildings.
 - Siting: The existing Red Cross structure has a front yard set back of 91.8 feet; the proposed structure will be almost 42 feet closer to the edge of the property. Per the DRO Development Design Guidelines, 35 Attachment 1, Appendix A, Siting "In the cases of new construction, the building, parking and landscaping shall be sited in a manner compatible with neighboring buildings."
- The proposed design is inconsistent with the 2000 Master Plan Historic Plan Element, the Master Plan Reexamination Report November 2006, and Master Plan Re-examination 2016 as The Red Cross was defined as historic.

- 2000 Master Plan: <https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/1396/2000-City-of-Summit-Master-Plan?bidId=> PDF p72, p76
 - 1. That it is in the public interest to identify and conserve sites and districts of historic interest.
 - 2. That the designation of historic sites and districts take into consideration not only the age of a structure, but its historic, cultural, sociological, archeological or architectural significance from a local, regional, statewide or national perspective.
 - Criteria 1. Important to the general development of the area and the unique cultural heritage of their communities.
 - Criteria 2. Significant examples of an architectural style or period.
 - Criteria 4. Associated with important persons or groups, with a social or political movement, or with an historical event.
 - Master Plan Reexamination Report November 2006 <https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/1394/2006-City-of-Summit-Reexamination?bidId= p51> (PDF p54)
 - Historic Preservation Objectives:
 - To recognize and preserve the historic character of the City.
 - To explore incentives to encourage the maintenance and façade restoration of historically notable buildings.
 - To encourage the preservation of historic buildings and landmarks that are significant to Summit's past.
 - Master Plan Re-examination 2016 https://www.cityofsummit.org/DocumentCenter/View/1602/Summit_ReVision_FINAL-Dec-2016?bidId= PDF p13
 - Goal 01: Guide Development to Maintain and Enhance Character of Summit
 - Objective 1.03: PDF p16
 - PROTECT EXISTING SITES THAT ARE OF HISTORIC VALUE TO PRESERVE THE CITY'S HISTORIC CHARACTER
 - Criteria: Site's historic, architectural or aesthetic value
 - Criteria: Historic listing or eligibility
 - Criteria: Setting, design, arrangement, texture, details, scale, shape, materials, finish, color, streetscape, and relationship of those characteristics to the surrounding neighborhood
 - Criteria: Extent to which proposed changes would alter the public's view of the property
 - Criteria: Importance of the site to the character of the City as a whole and adverse effects proposed changes may have on that character
 - The HPC objects to the application in its revised form. The HPC emphasizes that Adaptive Reuse is one of the greenest techniques that can be employed. Reuse is a great way to be sustainable while respecting the history of the community. We would suggest the applicant consider incorporating the existing principal structure into the design of the complex and could be a location for the meeting rooms, offices and other secondary functions that occupy the proposed sprawling footprint.
 - HPC restates the recommendation that the applicant seek a design solution that is more contextual; sensitive to the neighborhood and surroundings; and more consistent with the Development Design Guidelines in the DRO and the City's Master Plan.
2. 68 ValleyView Avenue: Minor subdivision – 1 to 2 lots (c) Variance for average lot width and steep slope disturbance. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-4.pdf> p149-150 c1895 **Contributes to streetscape.**
 3. 58 Valley View Avenue: (c) – variance for slope disturbance, in ground pool, patio, and landscaping. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-4.pdf> p141-142 c 1930 **Contributes to streetscape.**

4. 9 Sherman Avenue: (c) – variance for building coverage and lot coverage, and (d) – variances for FAR, two-story addition, and one-story addition. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Park-Avenue-cont-to-South-Street-Vol-7.pdf> p701-702 c1935 **Contributes to Sherman Park Historic District.**
5. 18 Sherman Avenue: (d) – variance for FAR, and (c) – variances for side yard setback and side yard combined to construct a second-story and first-story additions. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Park-Avenue-cont-to-South-Street-Vol-7.pdf> p717-718 c1930 **Contributes to Sherman Park Historic District.**
6. 136 Pine Grove Avenue: (c) variance for side yard setback for reconstructed porch and second-floor addition in the rear of the house. c1933
7. 9 Valley View Avenue: (c) variance for maximum building coverage. New outdoor fireplace, SPA, and pergola in the back of the house. c1952
8. 609 Springfield Avenue: (d) – variance for FAR, and (c) – variances for one-story addition, garage, and deck in side yard. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf> p37-38 Late 1880s **Contributes to streetscape.** Late 1880s c1887.
9. 25 Essex Road: (c) variance for side yard combo and building coverage to construct a 1-story addition. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Doremus-Street-to-Gloucester-Road-Vol-4.pdf> p199 1935 **Contributes to North Side Historic District.**
10. 112 Essex Road: (c) variance for side yard combo. Second story addition and new rear addition to enlarge existing room. c1953.
11. 475 Springfield Avenue: D1 use variance to permit retail on first floor. c1978/2005.

NEW BUSINESS

1. 115 Kent Place Boulevard: Summit Pediatric Dentistry <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Kent-Place-to-Llewellyn-Road-Vol-5.pdf> p71-72 c1890 Home of Summit's first mayor George Wilcox

OLD BUSINESS

1. Preservation NJ - HPC Roundtable booked at Twin Maples for November 1st
2. HPC Plaque: 47 Hillcrest Avenue:
 - 47 Hillcrest Avenue is a Shingle Style home, built in 1890. It was designed by noted Summit architect John N. Cady, who is credited with many of the homes built during this period in the North Side Historic District. The property was developed by Archer Martin as part of a collection of 5 lots on Hillcrest all designed by Cady. A barn was added to the property in the 1890's. The home was first occupied by Aubrey Martin and is often referred to as the Martin House.
 - The home is 2 ½ stories with a front-facing gambrel roof. The foundation is stone with clapboard siding cladding on the 1st floor and shingle siding cladding on the upper floors. Character-defining details include a decorative frieze, dentil moulding in the cornice, elliptical windows, gambrel-roofed dormers and flared shingles, all predominate in Shingle style homes. The decorative frieze features rope swag details on the front porch beams, around the side sunroom, and on attic window heads. Interior mouldings and wood flooring with border accents are all original to the home and well-maintained.
 - The original barn has been renovated as a pool house while retaining the charm and character of the historic structure. Elements such as the stable stalls, hay loft, and feed chutes have been creatively incorporated into the restoration of the interior spaces. Several additions have been made to the home and property over the years including a kitchen with glass-enclosed conservatory space and a detached garage accessory

structure. All the additions are complimentary of the original design and blend well with the historic home.

3. 2024 HPC Award Nominations

- 36 Kent Place Boulevard: c1875 <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Kent-Place-to-Llewellyn-Road-Vol-5.pdf> p19-20 Vernacular Second Empire. Restoration
- 41 Valley View Avenue: c1900 <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-4.pdf> p125-126 Shingle style Contributes to streetscape. Stewardship
- 9 Robinhood Road: c1935 <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Park-Avenue-cont-to-South-Street-Vol-7.pdf> p479-480 c1935 Contributes to District Ivanhoe Park North Side Historic District. Stewardship
- 17 Ashland Road: 1920 <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Ashland-Road-to-Beekman-Road-Vol-2.pdf> p21 c1920 Craftsman Style Bungalow Contributes to district Summit Home Land Co. Stewardship
- 13 Hughes Place: c1890 <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Greenbriar-Drive-to-John-Street-Vol-4-part-2.pdf> p377 c1890 Vernacular Victorian Contributes to district Deantown. Restoration.

LIASON UPDATES:

1. Planning Board
2. Council

MOTION TO ADJOURN

NEXT MEETING DATE: July 16, 2025